



10-25-04

AF 6/

032/02161 A05

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

Applicant: Shmuel AKERMAN, et al.
Serial Number: 09/856,761
Filed: May 23, 2001
For: A Method for Forming a Perspective Rendering from a Voxel Space
Art Unit: 2671
Examiner: Sealey, Lance W.

RECEIVED

OCT 25 2004

Technology Center 2600

Mail Stop AF
Commissioner for Patents
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

RESPONSE TO FINAL OFFICE ACTION

Sir:

The present letter is in response to a Final Office Action dated July 21, 2004 and is further to an interview conducted September 7, 2004.

The present application includes claims 1-52.

Applicants thank the Examiner for the interview with applicant's representative on September 7, 2004, in which agreement has been reached on the patentability of the claims.

Claims 1-5, 13, 19, 20, 22, 23, 28-30, 32-38, 40-49 and 51-52 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over Foley et al., Computer Graphics: Principles and Practice Second Edition in C and for some of the claims another reference.

As explained in the interview, applicants respectfully disagree.

Claim 1 requires:

- (b) accumulating the effect of opacity along a ray path, using opacity values at sampling points, into a ray storage value;
- (c) associating points along the cast ray with material classes; and
- (e) if the ray is determined to pass between classes, accumulating a lighting contribution of a surface, associated with a boundary between two classes, into the ray storage value.

In Foley, the effect of opacity along a ray path is accumulated into a ray as described on the last paragraph of page 1036. Foley, however, does not teach or suggest accumulating a lighting contribution of a surface, associated with a boundary between two classes, into the ray storage value.

Even if the term "material classes" is interpreted to mean different colors (e.g., different R, G, B or O values), as suggested by the Examiner, acts (d) and (e) are not carried out by Foley, as Foley does not teach or suggest determining if a ray passes between material classes and/or accumulating a lighting contribution of a surface, associated with a boundary between two classes, if the ray is determined to pass between classes.

For brevity, the dependent claims are not argued herein. The dependent claims are allowable at least because claim 1 is allowable.

In view of the above remarks, and the agreement reached in the interview, allowance of the application is respectfully awaited. If, however, the Examiner encountered a last minute problem, which can be solved in a telephone conversation, applicants respectfully request that the Examiner call the undersigned at 1 (877) 428-5468. Please note that this is a direct *toll free* number in the US that is answered in the undersigned's Israel office. Israel is 7 hours ahead of Washington.

Respectfully submitted,
Shmuel AKERMAN, et al.

for Paul Fenster
Yaakov Schatz,
Reg. No. 44,320

October 18, 2004
William H. Dippert, Esq.
Reed Smith LLP
599 Lexington Avenue, 29th Floor
New York, NY 10022-7650



RECEIVED

OCT 25 2004

Technology Center 2600

PTO/SB92 (08-00)

Approved for use through 10/31/2002. OMB 0651-0031

U. S. Patent and Trademark Office; U.S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

Under the Paperwork Reduction Act of 1995, no persons are required to respond to a collection of information unless it contains a valid OMB control number.

Certificate of Express Mail Under 37 CFR 1.10

I hereby certify that this correspondence is being deposited with the United States Postal Service Express Mail under 37 CFR 1.10 on the date indicated below and is addressed to:

Mail Stop:
Commissioner For Patents
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

on October 20, 2004

Date

11EV374589548US

Express Mail Label

Geraldine Gress

Reed Smith LLP
599 Lexington Avenue
29th Floor
New York, New York 10022-7650
Telephone: 212-521-5400; Facsimile: 212-521-5450

Note: Each paper must have its own certificate of mailing, or this certificate must identify each submitted paper.

Applicant: Shmuel Akerman et al.
Serial No: 09/856,761
Filing Date: May 23, 2001
For: Method For Forming A Perspective Rendering From A Voxel Space
Enclosures: (1) Transmittal Letter (in duplicate);
(2) Response To Final Office Action (2 pages);
(3) Acknowledgement postcard

Burden Hour Statement: This form is estimated to take 0.03 hours to complete. Time will vary depending upon the needs of the individual case. Any comments on the amount of time you are required to complete this form should be sent to the Chief Information Officer, U. S. Patent and Trademark Office, Washington, DC 20231. DO NOT SEND FEES OR COMPLETED FORMS TO THIS ADDRESS. SEND TO: Assistant Commissioner for Patents, Washington, DC 20231.

OCT 20 2004

TRANSMITTAL LETTER
(General - Patent Pending)Docket No.
032/02161

In Re Application Of: Shmuel AKERMAN et al.

Application No.	Filing Date	Examiner	Customer No.	Group Art Unit	Confirmation No.
09/856,761	May 23, 2001	SEALEY, Lance W.	44909	2671	3117

Title: A METHOD FOR FORMING A PERSPECTIVE RENDERING FROM A VOXEL SPACE

COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS:

RECEIVED

Transmitted herewith is:

Response to Final Office Action dated July 21, 2004

OCT 25 2004

Technology Center 2600

in the above identified application.

- ☒ No additional fee is required.
- ☐ A check in the amount of _____ is attached.
- ☒ The Director is hereby authorized to charge and credit Deposit Account No. 03-3419 as described below.
- ☐ Charge the amount of _____
- ☒ Credit any overpayment.
- ☒ Charge any additional fee required.
- ☐ Payment by credit card. Form PTO-2038 is attached.

WARNING: Information on this form may become public. Credit card information should not be included on this form. Provide credit card information and authorization on PTO-2038.


Signature

Dated: October 18, 2004

Paul FENSTER, Reg. No. 33,877

William H. Dippert, Esq.
Reed Smith LLP
599 Lexington Avenue, 29th Floor
New York, NY 10022-7650

Tel: (212) 521-5400

I hereby certify that this correspondence is being deposited with the United States Postal Service with sufficient postage as first class mail in an envelope addressed to the "Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450" [37 CFR 1.8(a)] on

(Date)

Signature of Person Mailing Correspondence

Typed or Printed Name of Person Mailing Correspondence

cc:

P18AREV03